

GS/POLS 6055 – GS/SPTH 6219  
3.0 M (W)

## **From Hegel to Marx**

Winter 2012

Course Director: Marcello Musto  
Lecture Time: Tue 17:30-20.30  
Class Location: Ross Building, S 674

Office Location: Ross Building, N 813  
Office Hours: Tue 15:30-16:30 / Thu 19:00-20:00  
Email: [marcello.musto@gmail.com](mailto:marcello.musto@gmail.com)  
Phone: 416 – 736 2100, Ext. 20241

### **Course Syllabus**

The course will examine some of the most important writings of the major German authors of the first half of the Nineteenth Century, who transformed irreversibly the philosophical and the political thought. The first part of the seminar will focus on two of Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel's main works: the *Phenomenology of the Spirit* and the *Elements of the Philosophy of Right*, which will also be considered in relation to the most important Marxist secondary literature on Hegel written in German (Herbert Marcuse, György Lukács and Ernst Bloch) and writings that played a big role in the French controversy on the relation between Hegel and Karl Marx (Alexandre Kojève and Jean Hyppolite).

The course will then concentrate on some of the key members of the Left Hegelian school, in particular Bruno Bauer, Ludwig Feuerbach, Marx and Max Stirner, through the analysis of their most influential works (among them Feuerbach's *The Essence of Christianity* and *Principles of Philosophy of the Future*; Marx's *Economic-Philosophical Manuscripts of 1844* and *The German Ideology* - written with Engels; and Stirner's *The Ego and Its Own*). In addition one will take up some of the debates of the time, like those on the critique of Christianity, the critique of the speculative thought, the overturning of Hegelian philosophy, materialism, atheism, and the role of the individual.

The main aim of the seminar will be reconstructing the elaboration of Marx's thought in its early stages. The path "from Hegel to Marx" will be investigated not solely philosophically but through an inter-disciplinary approach, i.e., analyzing the philosophical writings of the time, but vis-à-vis with Marx's discovery of political economy and Socialism. Therefore, besides philosophical

and political themes like species-being, human emancipation, and the relation between State and civil society, one will discuss other significant theoretical acquisitions by Marx, like the critique of alienated labour, the understanding of the revolutionary role of the proletariat, the adhesion to Communism, and the development of a materialist conception of history. This will be facilitated by highlighting Marx's decisive encounter with political economy - first through the writings of Friedrich Engels, Moses Heß and Pierre-Joseph Proudhon, and then Adam Smith and David Ricardo -, and by examining the influence that the early Socialists Henri de Saint Simon, Charles Fourier and Robert Owen had on the development of his ideas.

The final class of the course will look critically at the most influential Marxist writings published in the 1960s and 1970s on the "young Marx" versus "mature Marx" debate, revealing some of their textual limitations and interpretative mystifications. This will be pursued by through attention to the latest philological acquisitions related to Marx's works (the *Economic-Philosophical Manuscripts of 1844* and *The German Ideology* will be reconsidered on the basis of their new editions) and the most recent secondary literature on the Left Hegelians.

## Course Requirements

### Class Participation:

This course is taught in weekly seminars lasting 2 hours and 50 minutes. Attendance is strongly recommended and students are expected to participate actively in class discussion.

### Presentation:

Each class will begin with a student presentation (20 - 30 minutes) on the assigned readings. Please avoid just reading a paper aloud, and try to draw the attention of the class to issues on which the presenter would like class discussion and comment.

### Final Paper Proposal:

Students are free to propose their own final paper topic, but it must be related to the topics and the readings of the course syllabus. The final paper proposal should be 3-4 pages and include the following information:

- Indication of the title;
- Preliminary outline of the paper and its problematic;
- 6-8 keywords concerning the themes and concepts to be addressed;

- A bibliography of at least 8-10 sources consulted;

Final paper proposals will be due by 13 March, in hard copy and by email.

#### Final Paper:

The Final Paper, approved through the Final Paper Proposal, will be due in hard copy and by email 27 April and should:

- be approximately 5,000 words;
- be clearly structured (divided in at least 3 or 4 sections);
- have references from hard copy books with the indication of page numbers (no references from the internet other than published works).

#### Access to Readings:

The reading list has been organized as follows: each topic specifies a number of Required Readings. These are the minimum which you should read every week in order to be able to participate fully in the seminar discussions. You can go deeper into the topic using the Additional Readings, and you should do so with at least a couple of them when you prepare your presentations.

The volumes G. W. F. Hegel, *Phenomenology of Spirit*, OUP 1980, G. W. F. Hegel, *Outlines of the Philosophy of Right*, OUP 2008, and K. Marx, *Early Writings* (Penguin, 1992) have been ordered for the bookstore.

The writings of Marx and Engels published in the *Marx-Engels Collected Works* (50 volumes, 1975-2005) are available online at <http://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/cw/index.htm>.

Many of the required readings are available on-line (more information could be found at [www.marcellomusto.com](http://www.marcellomusto.com)); while the following books are on reserve at Scott library:

Adam Schaff, *Alienation as a Social Phenomenon*, Pergamon Press 1980

Iring Fetscher, *Marx and Marxism*, Seabury Pr 1971

Ernest Mandel, *The Formation of the Economic Thought of Karl Marx, 1843 to Capital*, Monthly Review Press 1971

David McNally, *Against the Market: Political Economy, Market Socialism and the Marxist Critique*, Verso 1996

Henri de Saint Simon, *Selected writings on science, industry and social organisation*, Croom Helm, 1975

Eric Hobsbawm, *How to Change the World: Tales of Marx and Marxism*, Little Brown 1982

Max Stirner, *The Ego and Its Own*, CUP 1995

Terrell Carver, *The Postmodern Marx*, Pennstate 1998

Karl Löwith, *From Hegel to Nietzsche*, Columbia University Press 1964

Michael Lowy, *The Theory of Revolution in the Young Marx*, Haymarket 2005

McLellan, *Marx before Marxism*, Palgrave Macmillan 1970

Auguste Cornu, *Karl Marx et Friedrich Engels. Leur vie et leur oeuvre*, PUF 1955-1970 (4 voll.)

Norman Levine, *Divergent Paths*, Lexington 2006

L.S. Stepelevich (ed.), *The Young Hegelians. An Anthology*, CUP 1983

David Leopold, *The Young Karl Marx*, Cambridge University Press 2007

Jean Hyppolite, *Studies on Marx and Hegel*, Harper & Row 1969

Alexandre Kojève, *Introduction to the Reading of Hegel: Lectures on the Phenomenology of Spirit*, Cornell University Press, 1980

György Lukács, *The Young Hegel*, Merlin Press 1975

Herbert Marcuse, *Reason and Revolution: Hegel and the Rise of Social Theory*, Humanity Books, 1999

Herbert Marcuse, *Hegel's Ontology and Theory of Historicity*, The MIT Press, 1989

Darren Webb, *Marx, Marxism and Utopia*, Ashgate 2000

Vincent Geoghegan, *Utopianism and Marxism*, Peter Lang 2008 [1987]

Ernst Bloch's *Subjekt-Objekt. Erläuterungen zu Hegel* has yet to be translated. Two chapters of the book have been published in academic journals ("Dialectics and Hope," translated by Mark Ritter in *New German Critique* in 1976 and "The Dialectical Method," translated by John Lamb in *Man and World* in 1983), but, unfortunately, the work as a whole remains unknown to the English-speaking world.

Bruno Bauer's *Die Judenfrage* has never been published in English. Nevertheless, a translation of this work was made by Helen Lederer (*The Jewish Question*, typescript dated 1958). A copy of this manuscript, held by the Hebrew Union College - Jewish Institute of Religion, Cincinnati - Ohio, has been photocopied for this class and it is now on reserve at Scott Library.

## Course Evaluation

Class Participation	20%
2 Presentations 15% each	30%
Final paper proposal	10%
Final paper	40%

## Schedule of Classes and Readings

**Jan 3 Introduction and overview**

**Jan 10 In the beginning there was Hegel**

### Required Readings:

Karl Löwith, *From Hegel to Nietzsche*, Columbia University Press, 1964 [1941] (Chapter 1)

Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel, *Phenomenology of the Spirit* [1807] (the following parts: Preface, Introduction, Chapter IV on 'Self-consciousness', and Chapter VIII on 'Absolute Knowing')

Karl Marx, *Economic-Philosophical Manuscripts of 1844* [1844] (section: 'Critique of Hegel's Philosophy in General')

### Additional Readings:

Karl Rosenkranz, *Hegels Leben*, WBG 1998 [1844].

Herbert Marcuse, *Hegel's Ontology and Theory of Historicity*, The MIT Press 1989 [1932]

Herbert Marcuse, *Reason and Revolution: Hegel and the Rise of Social Theory*, Humanity Books 1999 [1941]

György Lukács, *The Young Hegel*, Merlin Press 1975 [1938] (Part IV, Chapter 4: 'Entäusserung' as the central philosophical concept of *The Phenomenology of Mind*)

Alexandre Kojève, *Introduction to the Reading of Hegel: Lectures on the Phenomenology of Spirit*, Cornell University Press 1980 [1947] (especially 169-289)

Ernst Bloch, *Subjekt-Objekt. Erläuterungen zu Hegel*, Suhrkamp, 1962 [1949]

Jean Hyppolite, *Studies on Marx and Hegel*, Harper & Row, 1969 [1955]

<http://www.scribd.com/doc/24765650/Studies-on-Marx-and-Hegel-Jean-Hyppolite>

Theodor W. Adorno, *Hegel: Three Studies*, The MIT Press, 1993 [1963]

<http://www.scribd.com/doc/28370870/Adorno-Hegel-Three-Studies>

Norman Levine, *Divergent Paths*, Lexington 2006

## **Jan 17 Hegel and Marx on State and civil society**

### Required Readings:

Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel, *Elements of the Philosophy of Right* (§ 261-313) [1820]

Karl Marx, *Critique of Hegel's Philosophy of Right* [1843]

### Additional Readings:

Karl Marx, "Letter to his father (November 10, 1837)"

Gordon Hull, "Marx's anomalous reading of Spinoza", *Interpretation*, Vol. 28, n. 1 (1999), pp. 17-31

Maximilien Rubel – Margaret Manale, *Marx Without Myth: A Chronological Study of His Life and Work*, Blackwell 1975

David McLellan, *Karl Marx: his life and thought*, Palgrave 2006

Hal Draper, *The Marx-Engels Chronicle*, Schoken Books 1985

Marcello Musto, "The Rediscovery of Karl Marx", *International Review of Social History*, Vol. 52 part 3, (2007), pp. 477-498

## **Jan 24 Bauer and Marx on the Jewish question**

### Required Readings:

David Leopold, *The Young Karl Marx*, Cambridge University Press, 2007 (Chapter 3, pp. 100-182)

Bruno Bauer, *The Jewish Problem* [1842]

Karl Marx, *On the Jewish Question* [1844]

Friedrich Engels - Karl Marx, *The Holy family* [1845] (Chapter 6: Absolute Critical Criticism, Or Critical Criticism As Herr Bruno)

Additional Readings:

L.S. Stepelevich (ed.), *The Young Hegelians. An Anthology*, CUP 1983

[http://books.google.ie/books/about/The\\_Young\\_Hegelians\\_an\\_anthology.html?id=0X86AAAAIAAJ](http://books.google.ie/books/about/The_Young_Hegelians_an_anthology.html?id=0X86AAAAIAAJ)

Auguste Cornu, *Karl Marx et Friedrich Engels. Leur vie et leur oeuvre*, Puf 1955-1970

David McLellan, *Marx before Marxism*, Palgrave Macmillan 1970 (Chapters 1-3)

**Jan 31     Marx's encounter with political economy**

Required Readings:

Karl Marx, "Proceedings of the Sixth Rhine Province Assembly, third article, Debates on the Law on Thefts of Wood" [1842]

Karl Marx, "Contribution to a Critique of Hegel's Philosophy of Right. Introduction" [1844]

Friedrich Engels, "Outlines of a Critique of Political Economy" [1844]

Moses Heß, "The Essence of Money" [1845]

<http://www.marxists.org/archive/hess/1845/essence-money.htm>

Pierre-Joseph Proudhon, *What is property?* (Chapter 2) [1840]

<http://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/360>

Karl Marx, "Critical Notes on the Article 'The King of Prussia and Social Reform. By a Prussian'" [1844]

Additional Readings:

Karl Marx, *Letters from the Deutsch-Französische Jahrbücher* [1844]

Adam Smith, *An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations* [1776] (Book I, Chapters: I 'Of the Division of Labor'; VIII 'Of the Wages of Labour'; and IX 'Of the Profits of Stock')

David Ricardo, *On the Principles of Political Economy and Taxation* [1817] (Chapters: 1 'On value'; 2 'On rent'; 5 'Of wages'; 6 'On profit')

Friedrich Engels, *The Condition of the Working Class in England* [1845]

Daniel Bensaid, *Les dépossédés. Karl Marx, les voleurs de bois e le droit des pauvres*, La fabrique éditions, 2007

Michael Lowy, *The Theory of Revolution in the Young Marx*, Haymarket, 2005

## **Feb 7      Feuerbach and the passage from speculative philosophy to materialism**

### Required Readings:

Karl Löwith, *From Hegel to Nietzsche*, (Chapter 2: pp. 65-110)

Ludwig Feuerbach, "Towards a Critique of Hegel's Philosophy" [1839]

<http://marxists.org/reference/archive/feuerbach/works/critique/index.htm>

Ludwig Feuerbach, "Preliminary Theses on the Reform of Philosophy" [1843]

[http://books.google.ca/books?id=b2js6q67YEUC&pg=PA42&lpg=PA42&dq=feuerbach+Preliminary+Theses+on+the+Reform+of+Philosophy&source=bl&ots=I8V9AkxdPR&sig=Xs89TF2WVIJY7sPXNQYquMb8Vc4&hl=en&ei=L8JZTo3NAAtPegQepyKSVD&sa=X&oi=book\\_result&ct=result&resnum=3&ved=0CCoQ6AEwAg#v=onepage&q=feuerbach%20Preliminary%20Theses%20on%20the%20Reform%20of%20Philosophy&f=false](http://books.google.ca/books?id=b2js6q67YEUC&pg=PA42&lpg=PA42&dq=feuerbach+Preliminary+Theses+on+the+Reform+of+Philosophy&source=bl&ots=I8V9AkxdPR&sig=Xs89TF2WVIJY7sPXNQYquMb8Vc4&hl=en&ei=L8JZTo3NAAtPegQepyKSVD&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=3&ved=0CCoQ6AEwAg#v=onepage&q=feuerbach%20Preliminary%20Theses%20on%20the%20Reform%20of%20Philosophy&f=false)

Ludwig Feuerbach, *Principles of Philosophy of the Future* [1844]

<http://marxists.org/reference/archive/feuerbach/works/future/index.htm>

Karl Marx, *Theses on Feuerbach* [1845]

### Additional Readings:

Ludwig Feuerbach, *The Essence of Christianity* [1841]

<http://marxists.org/reference/archive/feuerbach/works/essence/index.htm>

Friedrich Engels, *Ludwig Feuerbach and the End of Classical German Philosophy* [1886]

## **Feb 14      Marx I. Alienated labour**

### Required Readings:

Marcello Musto, 'Marx in Paris. Manuscripts and notebooks of 1844', *Science & Society*, Vol. 73, n. 3 (July 2009): 386-402



Jürgen Rojahn, 'The emergence of a theory: the importance of Marx's notebooks exemplified by those from 1844', *Rethinking Marxism*, Vol. 14, n. 4 (2002): 29-46

Karl Marx, *Economic-Philosophical Manuscripts of 1844* [1844] (especially the sections: 'Estranged Labour', 'The Relationship of Private Property', 'Private Property and Labour', and 'Private Property and Communism')

Karl Marx, "Comments on James Mill, *Éléments d'économie Politique*" [1844]

Additional Readings:

Marcello Musto, "Revisiting Marx's Concept of Alienation", *Socialism and Democracy*, Vol. 24, n. 3 (November 2010): 79-101.

Terrell Carver, *Marx's conception of alienation in the 'Grundrisse'*, in Marcello Musto (ed.), *Karl Marx's Grundrisse. Foundations of the critique of political economy 150 years later*, Routledge, 2008 (pp. 48-66)

Michael Maidan, "The Rezeptionsgeschichte of the Paris Manuscripts", *History of European Ideas*, Vol. 12 (1990), pp. 767–781

**Feb 28     Marx II. The birth of the materialist conception of history**

Required Readings:

Karl Marx, 'Preface to A Contribution to the Critique of Political Economy' [1859]

Terrell Carver "The German Ideology Never Took Place", *History of Political Thought*, Vol. 31 (1), pp. 107-127

Friedrich Engels - Karl Marx, *The German Ideology* (Chapters I: "Feuerbach: Opposition of the Materialist and Idealist Outlooks", and II: 'Saint Bruno') [1845-46]

Additional Readings:

Terrell Carver, *The Postmodern Marx*, Pennstate 1998 (pp. 87-118)

Tadashi Shibuya, *Editorial problems in establishing a new edition of 'The German Ideology'*, in Hiroshi Uchida (ed.), *Marx for the 21<sup>st</sup> century*, Routledge 2006 (pp. 193-200)

Takahisa Oishi, *The unknown Marx*, Pluto 2001 (pp. 179-188)

**Mar 6     Stirner, or the nihilism of the critique**

Required Readings:

Max Stirner, *The Ego and Its Own* [1844], CUP 1995 (pp. 89-324)

<http://www.lsr-projekt.de/poly/enee.html>

Friedrich Engels - Karl Marx, *The German Ideology* [1845-46] (Chapter III: 'Saint Max')

#### Additional Readings:

Ludwig Feuerbach and Max Stirner on Atheism

<http://www.lsr-projekt.de/poly/enfeuerbach.html>

David Leopold, 'Introduction' in Max Stirner, *The Ego and Its Own*, CUP 1995, pp. xi-xxxii

### **Mar 13 The early Socialists and their influence on Marx**

#### Required Readings:

Eric Hobsbawm, *How to Change the World: Tales of Marx and Marxism* (chapter 2: 'Marx, Engels and Pre-Marxian socialism')

Karl Marx, *Plan of the "Library of the Best Foreign Socialist Writers"* [1845]

<http://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1845/03/writers.htm>

Friedrich Engels - Karl Marx, *The German Ideology* (Volume II: Critique of German Socialism According to Its Various Prophets)

Henri de Saint Simon, *Selected writings on science, industry and social organisation*, Croom Helm, 1975 (Part III: "From the government of men to the administration of things (1817-1820)", pp. 157-222)

Charles Fourier, 'The Phalanstery' (Fragment I)

<http://marxists.org/reference/archive/fourier/works/ch20.htm>

Charles Fourier, 'The Phalanstery' (Fragment II)

<http://marxists.org/reference/archive/fourier/works/ch27.htm>

Charles Fourier, 'Attractive Labour'

<http://marxists.org/reference/archive/fourier/works/ch26.htm>

Robert Owen, *A New View of Society* (Essay Two: 'The Principles of the Former Essay continued, and applied in part to Practice', and Essay Four: 'The end of government is to make the governed and the governors happy')

<http://marxists.org/reference/subject/economics/owen/index.htm#new-view>

Friedrich Engels – Karl Marx, *Manifesto of the Communist Party* (Chap. III: 'Socialist and Communist Literature')

<http://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1848/communist-manifesto/index.htm>

#### Additional Readings:

Carl Landauer, *European Socialism*, (Chapter I: 'The Three Anticapitalistic Movement', sections 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5) pp. 21-59

George D.H. Cole, *Socialist Thought, Volume I: The Forerunners 1789-1850*, (Chapters IV: 'Saint-Simon', VI: 'Fourier and Fourierism', IX: 'Owen and Owenism - Earlier Phases'), pp. 37-50, 62-74 and 86-101

Darren Webb, *Marx, Marxism and Utopia*, Ashgate 2000

Vincent Geoghegan, *Utopianism and Marxism*, Peter Lang 2008 [1987]

Friedrich Engels, "Description of Recently Founded Communist Colonies Still in Existence", and "Rapid Progress of Communism in Germany" (from MECW, vol. 4).

[Description of Recently Founded Communist Colonies Still in Existence](#)

[Rapid Progress of Communism in Germany](#)

### **Mar 20 Which kind of Socialism? Marx versus Proudhon**

#### Required Readings:

Pierre-Joseph Proudhon, *System of Economical Contradictions; or, the Philosophy of Misery* [1846] (From the English translation the chapters: "Introduction", I. "Of the economic science", and from the original French edition the chapters IX. "La Communauté", and X. "Conclusion")

<http://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/444>

[http://classiques.uqac.ca/classiques/Proudhon/systeme\\_contr\\_eco/systeme\\_contr\\_eco.html](http://classiques.uqac.ca/classiques/Proudhon/systeme_contr_eco/systeme_contr_eco.html)  
(pp. 129-155 of the PDF file)

Friedrich Engels - Karl Marx, *The Holy Family* [1845] (Chapter IV, § 4 "Proudhon")

Karl Marx, *The Poverty of Philosophy* [1847] (Chapter II: 'The Metaphysics of Political Economy')

Karl Marx, "Letter to Pavel Vasilyevich Annenkov (December 28, 1846)"

### Additional Readings:

Pierre-Joseph Proudhon, *General Idea of the Revolution in the Nineteenth Century* (Chap. III: 'The Principle of Association', and Chap. VI: section 3: 'Division of Labour, Collective Forces, Machines, Workingmen's Associations')

<http://fair-use.org/p-j-proudhon/general-idea-of-the-revolution/>

Karl Marx, *On Proudhon*

[http://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1865/letters/65\\_01\\_24.htm](http://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1865/letters/65_01_24.htm)

David McNally, *Against the Market: Political Economy, Market Socialism and the Marxist Critique*, Verso 1996 (Chapter 5: 'Proudhon Did Enormous Mischief': Marx's Critique of the First Market Socialists'), pp. 139-169

### **Mar 27 The myth of the "young Marx"**

#### Required Readings:

Marcello Musto, "The myth of the 'young Marx' in the interpretations of the *Economic and Philosophic Manuscripts of 1844*" [forthcoming 2012]

Ernest Mandel, *The Formation of the Economic Thought of Karl Marx, 1843 to Capital*, Monthly Review Press 1971 [1967] (Chapter X)

Louis Althusser, *For Marx*, Verso 2005 [1965] (Chapter 2: 'On the Young Marx')

<http://www.marx2mao.com/Other/FM65i.html>

Louis Althusser, *Essays in Self-Criticism*, New Left Books 1976 ('Reply to John Lewis' - 1973; and 'Elements of Self-Criticism' - 1974)

<http://www.marx2mao.com/Other/ESC76NB.html>

István Mészáros, *Marx's Theory of Alienation* [1970]

<http://www.marxists.org/archive/meszaros/works/alien/index.htm>

Adam Schaff, *Alienation as a Social Phenomenon*, Pergamon Press 1980 [1977] (Part I: 'Marxism and the theory of alienation')

Bertell Ollman, *Alienation: Marx's conception of man in capitalist society*, CUP 1971 (Chapters 1-4, 18-22)

<http://www.nyu.edu/projects/ollman/books/a.php>

Iring Fetscher, *Marx and Marxism*, Seabury Pr 1971 [1967] (Chapter 1 and the Appendix I)

Additional Readings:

Marcello Musto, 'The Formation of Marx's Critique of Political Economy: From the Studies of 1843 to the *Grundrisse*', *Socialism & Democracy*, Vol. 24 n. 3 (July 2010): 66-100